## Curvature of Graphs

Jürgen Jost<br>Max Planck Institute for<br>Mathematics in the Sciences<br>Leipzig



## Motivations

(1) Explore concepts of metric geometry in the context of graph theory

## Motivations

(1) Explore concepts of metric geometry in the context of graph theory
(2) Develop efficient tools for the qualitative analysis of empirical networks (from neurobiology, molecular biology, social systems,...)

## Curvature in Riemannian geometry

Three types: ${ }^{1}$

- Scalar curvature
- Ricci curvature
- Sectional curvature
${ }^{1}$ J.J., Riemannian Geometry and Geometric Analysis, Springer, 6th ed., 2011


## Curvature in Riemannian geometry

Three types: ${ }^{1}$

- Scalar curvature $\longrightarrow$ assigned to points
- Ricci curvature $\longrightarrow$ assigned to tangent vectors
- Sectional curvature $\longrightarrow$ assigned to tangent planes
${ }^{1}$ J.J., Riemannian Geometry and Geometric Analysis, Springer, 6th ed., 2011


## Curvature of graphs

- Scalar curvature $\longrightarrow$ assigned to points
$\longrightarrow$ assigned to vertices
- Ricci curvature $\longrightarrow$ assigned to tangent vectors
$\longrightarrow$ assigned to directions=edges (2 vertices)
- Sectional curvature $\longrightarrow$ assigned to tangent planes
$\longrightarrow$ assigned to triangles (3 vertices)


## Curvature in Riemannian geometry

## Scalar

Scalar curvature is a relatively weak invariant.

## Curvature in Riemannian geometry

## Scalar

Scalar curvature is a relatively weak invariant.

## Ricci

Ricci curvature controls expansion properties of volumes or of stochastic processes, as it averages over the divergence of geodesic curves.

## Curvature in Riemannian geometry

## Scalar

Scalar curvature is a relatively weak invariant.

## Ricci

Ricci curvature controls expansion properties of volumes or of stochastic processes, as it averages over the divergence of geodesic curves.
$\longrightarrow$ Lower bounds carry geometric content

## Curvature in Riemannian geometry

## Scalar

Scalar curvature is a relatively weak invariant.

## Ricci

Ricci curvature controls expansion properties of volumes or of stochastic processes, as it averages over the divergence of geodesic curves.
$\longrightarrow$ Lower bounds carry geometric content, in contrast to upper bounds (Lohkamp: Every manifold carries a metric with negative Ricci).

## Curvature in Riemannian geometry

## Scalar

Scalar curvature is a relatively weak invariant.

## Ricci

Ricci curvature controls expansion properties of volumes or of stochastic processes, as it averages over the divergence of geodesic curves.
$\longrightarrow$ Lower bounds carry geometric content, in contrast to upper bounds (Lohkamp: Every manifold carries a metric with negative Ricci).

## Sectional

Sectional curvature controls distances in triangles from above.

## Curvature in Riemannian geometry

## Scalar

Scalar curvature is a relatively weak invariant.

## Ricci

Ricci curvature controls expansion properties of volumes or of stochastic processes, as it averages over the divergence of geodesic curves.
$\longrightarrow$ Lower bounds carry geometric content, in contrast to upper bounds (Lohkamp: Every manifold carries a metric with negative Ricci).

## Sectional

Sectional curvature controls distances in triangles from above.
$\longrightarrow$ Upper bounds are geometrically powerful.

## Curvature in Riemannian geometry

## Scalar

Scalar curvature is a relatively weak invariant.

## Ricci

Ricci curvature controls expansion properties of volumes or of stochastic processes, as it averages over the divergence of geodesic curves.
$\longrightarrow$ Lower bounds carry geometric content, in contrast to upper bounds (Lohkamp: Every manifold carries a metric with negative Ricci).

## Sectional

Sectional curvature controls distances in triangles from above.
$\longrightarrow$ Upper bounds are geometrically powerful.
Manifolds of negative or nonpositive sectional curvature are geometrically well understood, whereas the geometry of those of positive or nonnegative curvature is still not clear.

## Curvature in Riemannian geometry, ctd.

Example: Relation between volume of a ball and area of its boundary sphere

## Ricci

With a lower Ricci curvature bound, the interior of a ball controls its boundary
$\longrightarrow$ from local to global

## Sectional

With an upper sectional bound, the boundary of a ball controls its interior.
$\longrightarrow$ from asymptotic to local

## Curvature in Riemannian geometry, ctd.

## Ricci

Ricci curvature controls local properties.
When such properties hold everywhere locally, they have global geometric consequences.

## Curvature in Riemannian geometry, ctd.

## Ricci

Ricci curvature controls local properties.
When such properties hold everywhere locally, they have global geometric consequences.
Example: Ric $\geq K>0$ implies $b_{1}=0$ (Bochner), $\lambda_{1} \geq K^{\prime}>0$
(Lichnerowicz)
(first nonzero Laplace eigenvalue)

## Curvature in Riemannian geometry, ctd.

## Ricci

Ricci curvature controls local properties.
When such properties hold everywhere locally, they have global geometric consequences.
Example: Ric $\geq K>0$ implies $b_{1}=0$ (Bochner), $\lambda_{1} \geq K^{\prime}>0$
(Lichnerowicz)
(first nonzero Laplace eigenvalue)

## Sectional

Sectional curvature controls global or asymptotic properties.

## Curvature in Riemannian geometry, ctd.

## Ricci

Ricci curvature controls local properties.
When such properties hold everywhere locally, they have global
geometric consequences.
Example: Ric $\geq K>0$ implies $b_{1}=0$ (Bochner), $\lambda_{1} \geq K^{\prime}>0$
(Lichnerowicz)
(first nonzero Laplace eigenvalue)

## Sectional

Sectional curvature controls global or asymptotic properties.
Such properties may hold in spite of local fluctuations.
Example: Gromov hyperbolicity in geometric group theory.

## Curvature in Riemannian geometry, ctd.

## Ricci

Ricci curvature controls local properties.
When such properties hold everywhere locally, they have global
geometric consequences.
Example: Ric $\geq K>0$ implies $b_{1}=0$ (Bochner), $\lambda_{1} \geq K^{\prime}>0$
(Lichnerowicz)
(first nonzero Laplace eigenvalue)

## Sectional

Sectional curvature controls global or asymptotic properties.
Such properties may hold in spite of local fluctuations.
Example: Gromov hyperbolicity in geometric group theory.

Conclusion: Ricci and sectional curvature bounds play opposite roles in geometry.

## Volume growth

Ric $\geq 0$ implies (at most) polynomial volume growth (R.Bishop) and polynomial growth of finitely generated subgroups of $\pi_{1}$ (J.Milnor) (same growth rates by an earlier result of A.S.Schwarz), whereas $\mathrm{Sec}<0$ implies exponential volume growth on universal cover (P.Günther) and of $\pi_{1}$ (J.Milnor).

## Volume growth

Ric $\geq 0$ implies that bounded harmonic functions are constant (S.T.Yau) and a dimension estimate for polynomial growth harmonic functions (Colding-Minicozzi, P.Li).

[^0]
## Volume growth

Ric $\geq 0$ implies that bounded harmonic functions are constant (S.T.Yau) and a dimension estimate for polynomial growth harmonic functions (Colding-Minicozzi, P.Li).
Analogous results for Cayley graphs of finitely generated groups of polynomial growth. Such groups are virtually nilpotent (M.Gromov). Polynomial growth harmonic function theorem on Cayley graphs of such groups gives a new proof (B.Kleiner; quantitative version by Shalom-Tao).

[^1]
## Volume growth

Ric $\geq 0$ implies that bounded harmonic functions are constant (S.T.Yau) and a dimension estimate for polynomial growth harmonic functions (Colding-Minicozzi, P.Li).
Analogous results for Cayley graphs of finitely generated groups of polynomial growth. Such groups are virtually nilpotent (M.Gromov). Polynomial growth harmonic function theorem on Cayley graphs of such groups gives a new proof (B.Kleiner; quantitative version by Shalom-Tao). Optimal estimate ${ }^{2}$

## Theorem

Let $(G, S)$ be a Cayley graph of a group of polynomial growth with the homogeneous dimension $D$. Then for $d \geq 1$, the space $H^{d}(G, S)$ of harmonic functions of degree $d$ satisfies

$$
\operatorname{dim} H^{d}(G, S) \leq C(S) d^{D-1}
$$

Holds also on graphs (with bounded geometry) roughly isometric to Cayley graphs of groups of polynomial growth.

[^2]
## Curvature of graphs: Forman-Ricci

Weighted graph with edge weights $w_{e}$ and vertex weights $w_{v}$.
$v \sim w$ : vertices $v$ and $w$ connected by an edge,
$e \sim f$ : edges $e$ and $f$ share a vertex.
Forman's curvature ${ }^{3}$ for an edge $e$ connecting vertices $v_{1}, v_{2}$.
$\operatorname{Ric}(e)=w_{e}\left(\frac{w_{v_{1}}}{w_{e}}+\frac{w_{v_{2}}}{w_{e}}-\sum_{e_{v_{1}} \sim e, e_{v_{2}} \sim e}\left[\frac{w_{v_{1}}}{\sqrt{w_{e} w_{e_{v_{1}}}}}+\frac{w_{v_{2}}}{\sqrt{w_{e} w_{e_{v_{2}}}}}\right]\right)$
where $e_{v_{1}}, e_{v_{2}}$ denote the set of edges $\neq e$ connected to vertices $v_{1}$ and $v_{2}$, resp.
${ }^{3}$ R.Forman, Discrete Comput. Geom. 29:323-374 (2003)

## Curvature of graphs: Forman-Ricci

Weighted graph with edge weights $w_{e}$ and vertex weights $w_{v}$. Forman's curvature ${ }^{3}$ for an edge $e$ connecting vertices $v_{1}, v_{2}$.
$\operatorname{Ric}(e)=w_{e}\left(\frac{w_{v_{1}}}{w_{e}}+\frac{w_{v_{2}}}{w_{e}}-\sum_{e_{v_{1}} \sim e, e_{v_{2}} \sim e}\left[\frac{w_{v_{1}}}{\sqrt{w_{e} w_{e_{v_{1}}}}}+\frac{w_{v_{2}}}{\sqrt{w_{e} w_{e_{v_{2}}}}}\right]\right)$
where $e_{v_{1}}, e_{v_{2}}$ denote the set of edges $\neq e$ connected to vertices $v_{1}$ and $v_{2}$, resp.
For an unweighted graph, simply

$$
\begin{equation*}
\operatorname{Ric}(e)=2-\operatorname{deg} v_{1}-\operatorname{deg} v_{2} \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

${ }^{3}$ R.Forman, Discrete Comput. Geom. 29:323-374 (2003)

## Curvature of graphs: Forman-Ricci

Weighted graph with edge weights $w_{e}$ and vertex weights $w_{v}$. Forman's curvature ${ }^{3}$ for an edge $e$ connecting vertices $v_{1}, v_{2}$.
$\operatorname{Ric}(e)=w_{e}\left(\frac{w_{v_{1}}}{w_{e}}+\frac{w_{v_{2}}}{w_{e}}-\sum_{e_{v_{1}} \sim e, e_{v_{2}} \sim e}\left[\frac{w_{v_{1}}}{\sqrt{w_{e} w_{e_{v_{1}}}}}+\frac{w_{v_{2}}}{\sqrt{w_{e} w_{e_{v_{2}}}}}\right]\right)$
where $e_{v_{1}}, e_{v_{2}}$ denote the set of edges $\neq e$ connected to vertices $v_{1}$ and $v_{2}$, resp.
For an unweighted graph, simply

$$
\begin{equation*}
\operatorname{Ric}(e)=2-\operatorname{deg} v_{1}-\operatorname{deg} v_{2} \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

Comes from a combinatorial Bochner formula.

[^3]
## Curvature of graphs: Forman-Ricci

Weighted graph with edge weights $w_{e}$ and vertex weights $w_{v}$. Forman's curvature ${ }^{3}$ for an edge $e$ connecting vertices $v_{1}, v_{2}$.
$\operatorname{Ric}(e)=w_{e}\left(\frac{w_{v_{1}}}{w_{e}}+\frac{w_{v_{2}}}{w_{e}}-\sum_{e_{v_{1}} \sim e, e_{v_{2}} \sim e}\left[\frac{w_{v_{1}}}{\sqrt{w_{e} w_{e_{v_{1}}}}}+\frac{w_{v_{2}}}{\sqrt{w_{e} w_{e_{v_{2}}}}}\right]\right)$
where $e_{v_{1}}, e_{v_{2}}$ denote the set of edges $\neq e$ connected to vertices $v_{1}$ and $v_{2}$, resp.
For an unweighted graph, simply

$$
\begin{equation*}
\operatorname{Ric}(e)=2-\operatorname{deg} v_{1}-\operatorname{deg} v_{2} \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

Comes from a combinatorial Bochner formula. A graph with Ric $>0$ has $b_{1}=0$.

[^4]
## Curvature of graphs: Forman-Ricci

Weighted graph with edge weights $w_{e}$ and vertex weights $w_{v}$. Forman's curvature ${ }^{3}$ for an edge $e$ connecting vertices $v_{1}, v_{2}$.
$\operatorname{Ric}(e)=w_{e}\left(\frac{w_{v_{1}}}{w_{e}}+\frac{w_{v_{2}}}{w_{e}}-\sum_{e_{v_{1}} \sim e, e_{v_{2}} \sim e}\left[\frac{w_{v_{1}}}{\sqrt{w_{e} w_{e_{v_{1}}}}}+\frac{w_{v_{2}}}{\sqrt{w_{e} w_{e_{v_{2}}}}}\right]\right)$
where $e_{v_{1}}, e_{v_{2}}$ denote the set of edges $\neq e$ connected to vertices $v_{1}$ and $v_{2}$, resp.
For an unweighted graph, simply

$$
\begin{equation*}
\operatorname{Ric}(e)=2-\operatorname{deg} v_{1}-\operatorname{deg} v_{2} \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

Comes from a combinatorial Bochner formula. A graph with Ric $>0$ has $b_{1}=0$. Less trivial for higher dimensional simplicial complexes.

[^5]
## Curvature of graphs: Forman-Ricci

Let now $\Gamma$ be a directed graph, $e$ an edge with tail $v$. We ${ }^{4}$ define the Ricci curvature of $e$ as

$$
\begin{equation*}
\operatorname{Ric}(e)=w_{e}\left(\frac{w_{v}}{w_{e}}-\sum_{e_{v} \sim e} \frac{w_{v}}{\sqrt{w_{e} w_{e_{v}}}}\right) \tag{3}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $e_{v}$ denotes the set of edges $\neq e$ connected to vertex $v$.

## Curvature of graphs: Forman-Ricci

Let now $\Gamma$ be a directed graph, $e$ an edge with tail $v$. We ${ }^{4}$ define the Ricci curvature of $e$ as

$$
\begin{equation*}
\operatorname{Ric}(e)=w_{e}\left(\frac{w_{v}}{w_{e}}-\sum_{e_{v} \sim e} \frac{w_{v}}{\sqrt{w_{e} w_{e_{v}}}}\right) \tag{3}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $e_{v}$ denotes the set of edges $\neq e$ connected to vertex $v$.

Together with the students Melanie Weber, R.P. Sreejith, Karthikeyan Mohanraj, we currently investigate the Ricci curvature properties of undirected and directed empirical networks. It turns out that Ricci curvature seems to be a good indicator of other, more global and hence more difficult to compute, properties of real networks.

[^6]
## Curvature of graphs: Ollivier-Ricci

Degree $d_{v}:=\#($ neighbors of $v)$

$$
m_{v}\left(v^{\prime}\right):=\left\{\begin{array}{l}
\frac{1}{d_{v}} \text { if } v^{\prime} \sim v \\
0 \text { else }
\end{array}\right.
$$

Wasserstein distance of measures $m_{v}, m_{w}$ for $v \sim w$

$$
W_{1}\left(m_{v}, m_{w}\right):=\min _{\xi \in \Pi\left(m_{v}, m_{w}\right)} \sum_{V \times V} \operatorname{dist}\left(v^{\prime}, w^{\prime}\right) \xi\left(v^{\prime}, w^{\prime}\right),
$$

where $\Pi\left(m_{v}, m_{w}\right)$ is the set of all measures with marginals $\mu$ and $\nu$ (transportations from $m_{v}$ to $m_{w}$.
Optimal transport of neighborhood of $v$ to that of $w$.

[^7]
## Curvature of graphs: Ollivier-Ricci

$$
m_{v}\left(v^{\prime}\right):=\left\{\begin{array}{l}
\frac{1}{d_{v}} \text { if } v^{\prime} \sim v \\
0 \text { else }
\end{array}\right.
$$

Wasserstein distance of measures $m_{v}, m_{w}$ for $v \sim w$

$$
W_{1}\left(m_{v}, m_{w}\right):=\min _{\xi \in \Pi\left(m_{v}, m_{w}\right)} \sum_{V \times V} \operatorname{dist}\left(v^{\prime}, w^{\prime}\right) \xi\left(v^{\prime}, w^{\prime}\right),
$$

where $\Pi\left(m_{v}, m_{w}\right)$ is the set of all measures with marginals $\mu$ and $\nu$ (transportations from $m_{v}$ to $m_{w}$.
Optimal transport of neighborhood of $v$ to that of $w$.
Ollivier-Ricci curvature ${ }^{5}$

$$
\begin{equation*}
\kappa(v, w):=1-\frac{W_{1}\left(m_{v}, m_{w}\right)}{\operatorname{dist}(v, w)} \tag{4}
\end{equation*}
$$

${ }^{5}$ Y. Ollivier, J. Funct.Anal. 256 (2009) 810-864

## Curvature of graphs: Ollivier-Ricci

$$
\begin{aligned}
\#(v, w) & :=\#(\text { triangles with vertices } v, w) \\
& =\#(\text { common neighbors of } v, w) .
\end{aligned}
$$

Theorem

$$
\begin{gathered}
\kappa(v, w) \geq-\left(1-\frac{1}{d_{v}}-\frac{1}{d_{w}}-\frac{\#(v, w)}{\min \left(d_{v}, d_{w}\right)}\right)_{+} \\
-\left(1-\frac{1}{d_{v}}-\frac{1}{d_{w}}-\frac{\#(v, w)}{\max \left(d_{v}, d_{w}\right)}\right)_{+} \\
+\frac{\#(v, w)}{\max \left(d_{v}, d_{w}\right)}
\end{gathered}
$$

and also

$$
\kappa(v, w) \leq \frac{\#(v, w)}{\max \left(d_{v}, d_{w}\right)} .
$$

## Curvature of graphs: Ollivier-Ricci

Theorem

$$
\begin{array}{r}
\kappa(v, w) \geq-\left(1-\frac{1}{d_{v}}-\frac{1}{d_{w}}-\frac{\#(v, w)}{\min \left(d_{v}, d_{w}\right)}\right)_{+} \\
-\left(1-\frac{1}{d_{v}}-\frac{1}{d_{w}}-\frac{\#(v, w)}{\max \left(d_{v}, d_{w}\right)}\right)_{+} \\
+\frac{\#(v, w)}{\max \left(d_{v}, d_{w}\right)}
\end{array}
$$

and also

$$
\kappa(v, w) \leq \frac{\#(v, w)}{\max \left(d_{v}, d_{w}\right)}
$$

Example: $K_{n}: \#(v, w)=n-2, \kappa(v, w)=\frac{n-2}{n-1}$.

## Curvature of graphs: Ollivier-Ricci

Theorem

$$
\begin{aligned}
\kappa(v, w) \geq-\left(1-\frac{1}{d_{v}}\right. & \left.-\frac{1}{d_{w}}-\frac{\#(v, w)}{\min \left(d_{v}, d_{w}\right)}\right)+ \\
-\left(1-\frac{1}{d_{v}}\right. & \left.-\frac{1}{d_{w}}-\frac{\#(v, w)}{\max \left(d_{v}, d_{w}\right)}\right)+ \\
& +\frac{\#(v, w)}{\max \left(d_{v}, d_{w}\right)}
\end{aligned}
$$

and also

$$
\kappa(v, w) \leq \frac{\#(v, w)}{\max \left(d_{v}, d_{w}\right)}
$$

Triangles, quadrangles and pentagons containing $v$ and $w$ help to reduce the transportation cost. Without such short cycles, neighbors of $v$ and $w$ (other than $w$ and $v$ themselves) have distance $=3$.
${ }^{6}$ S.P.Liu, J.J., Discrete Comput.Geom. 51, 300-322 (2014)

## Curvature of graphs: Ollivier-Ricci

$$
\kappa(v, w)=1-\frac{W_{1}\left(m_{v}, m_{w}\right)}{\operatorname{dist}(v, w)} \text { assume }>k .
$$

Eigenvalues of $\Delta$ satisfy (Ollivier)

$$
k \leq \lambda \leq 2-k
$$

${ }^{7}$ F.Bauer, J.J., S.P.Liu, Math.Res.Lett.19, 1185-1205 (2012)

## Curvature of graphs: Ollivier-Ricci

$$
\kappa(v, w)=1-\frac{W_{1}\left(m_{v}, m_{w}\right)}{\operatorname{dist}(v, w)} \text { assume }>k .
$$

Eigenvalues of $\Delta$ satisfy (Ollivier)

$$
k \leq \lambda \leq 2-k
$$

Unfortunately, $k \leq 0$ for most graphs.

## Curvature of graphs: Ollivier-Ricci

$$
\kappa(v, w)=1-\frac{W_{1}\left(m_{v}, m_{w}\right)}{\operatorname{dist}(v, w)} \text { assume }>k
$$

Eigenvalues of $\Delta$ satisfy (Ollivier)

$$
k \leq \lambda \leq 2-k
$$

Unfortunately, $k \leq 0$ for most graphs. Improve estimate ${ }^{7}$ by considering neighborhood graph of order $t$, with weights $w_{v, w}$ given by probabilies for reaching $w$ from $v$ in $t$ steps,

$$
1-(1-k[t])^{1 / t} \leq \lambda \leq 1+(1-k[t])^{1 / t}
$$

where

$$
k[t]>0 \text { for } t \gg 0 \quad \text { unless } \Gamma \text { is bipartite. }
$$

## Sectional curvature

3 aspects of nonpositive curvature
(1) Turnpike theorem: Two shortest connections are never further apart than their endpoints.

## Sectional curvature

3 aspects of nonpositive curvature
(1) Turnpike theorem: Two shortest connections are never further apart than their endpoints.
(2) Alexandrov triangle comparison: The midpoint of an edge of a triangle (composed of shortest geodesics) is not further away from the 3rd vertex than it would in a Euclidean comparison triangle (same side lengths).

## Sectional curvature

3 aspects of nonpositive curvature
(1) Turnpike theorem: Two shortest connections are never further apart than their endpoints.
(2) Alexandrov triangle comparison: The midpoint of an edge of a triangle (composed of shortest geodesics) is not further away from the 3rd vertex than it would in a Euclidean comparison triangle (same side lengths).
(3) $\mathbf{3}$ can easily meet: The smallest maximal distance of a point to three given points is not larger than it would be in a Euclidean comparison triangle.

## Sectional curvature

3 aspects of nonpositive curvature
(1) Turnpike theorem: Two shortest connections are never further apart than their endpoints.
(2) Alexandrov triangle comparison: The midpoint of an edge of a triangle (composed of shortest geodesics) is not further away from the 3rd vertex than it would in a Euclidean comparison triangle (same side lengths).
(3) $\mathbf{3}$ can easily meet: The smallest maximal distance of a point to three given points is not larger than it would be in a Euclidean comparison triangle.
(For curvature $\leq K$, instead of $\leq 0$, we use a surface of constant curvature $K$ in place of the Euclidean plane.)

## Sectional curvature of graphs

Let $\gamma(v, w)$ be a shortest path in $\Gamma$ (connected) between the vertices $v, w$.

## Sectional curvature of graphs

Let $\gamma(v, w)$ be a shortest path in $\Gamma$ (connected) between the vertices $v, w$.
Let $u, v, w$ be vertices. $\Gamma$ has nonpositive sectional curvature (in the sense of Alexandrov) if for all $u^{\prime} \in \gamma(v, w)$,

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \operatorname{dist}\left(u, u^{\prime}\right) \leq \quad\left(1-\frac{\operatorname{dist}\left(v, u^{\prime}\right)}{\operatorname{dist}(v, w)}\right) \operatorname{dist}^{2}(v, u) \\
& \quad+\frac{\operatorname{dist}\left(v, u^{\prime}\right)}{\operatorname{dist}(v, w)} \operatorname{dist}^{2}(w, u) \\
& -\frac{\operatorname{dist}\left(v, u^{\prime}\right)}{\operatorname{dist}(v, w)}\left(1-\frac{\operatorname{dist}\left(v, u^{\prime}\right)}{\operatorname{dist}(v, w)}\right) \operatorname{dist}^{2}(v, w)
\end{aligned}
$$

that is, if the shortest path from $v$ to $w$ is not farther away from another vertex $u$ than were the case in a Euclidean triangle with the same side lengths.

## Sectional curvature of graphs

Alternative definition ${ }^{8}$ :

$$
\min _{s \in V} \max (\operatorname{dist}(s, u), \operatorname{dist}(s, v), \operatorname{dist}(s, w))
$$

is not larger than the corresponding quantity in Euclidean space.

[^8]
## Sectional curvature of graphs

Alternative definition ${ }^{8}$ :

$$
\min _{s \in V} \max (\operatorname{dist}(s, u), \operatorname{dist}(s, v), \operatorname{dist}(s, w))
$$

is not larger than the corresponding quantity in Euclidean space. This definition also works on disconnected metric spaces.

[^9]
## Sectional curvature of graphs

Alternative definition ${ }^{8}$ :

$$
\min _{s \in V} \max (\operatorname{dist}(s, u), \operatorname{dist}(s, v), \operatorname{dist}(s, w))
$$

is not larger than the corresponding quantity in Euclidean space.
This definition also works on disconnected metric spaces.
In order to capture asymptotic aspects, one may allow for an error $\varepsilon$ that is independent of the distances between the vertices $u, v, w$.

[^10]
[^0]:    ${ }^{2}$ B.B.Hua, J.J., Math.Z. 280:551-567 (2015); related work with B.B.Hua, S.P.Liu, X.Li-Jost

[^1]:    ${ }^{2}$ B.B.Hua, J.J., Math.Z. 280:551-567 (2015); related work with B.B.Hua, S.P.Liu, X.Li-Jost

[^2]:    ${ }^{2}$ B.B.Hua, J.J., Math.Z. 280:551-567 (2015); related work with B.B.Hua, S.P.Liu, X.Li-Jost

[^3]:    ${ }^{3}$ R.Forman, Discrete Comput. Geom. 29:323-374 (2003)

[^4]:    ${ }^{3}$ R.Forman, Discrete Comput. Geom. 29:323-374 (2003)

[^5]:    ${ }^{3}$ R.Forman, Discrete Comput. Geom. 29:323-374 (2003)

[^6]:    ${ }^{4}$ A.Samal, E.Saucan, J.J., to appear

[^7]:    ${ }^{5}$ Y. Ollivier, J. Funct.Anal. 256 (2009) 810-864

[^8]:    ${ }^{8}$ M. Bačák, B. Hua, J. J., M. Kell and A. Schikorra, Diff.Geom.Appl. 38, 22-32 (2015)

[^9]:    ${ }^{8}$ M. Bačák, B. Hua, J. J., M. Kell and A. Schikorra, Diff.Geom.Appl. 38, 22-32 (2015)

[^10]:    ${ }^{8}$ M. Bačák, B. Hua, J. J., M. Kell and A. Schikorra, Diff.Geom.Appl. 38, 22-32 (2015)

